# Orbit-Product Representation and Correction of Gaussian Belief Propagation

Jason Johnson<sup>a</sup>, Vladimir Chernyak<sup>b,a</sup>, Michael Chertkov<sup>a</sup> <sup>a</sup>Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, New Mexico <sup>b</sup>Wayne State University, Detroit, Michigan

> International Conference on Machine Learning Montreal, Quebec June 16, 2009

# **Graphical Models**

A graphical model is a multivariate probability distribution that is expressed in terms of interactions among subsets of variables (e.g. pairwise interactions on the edges of a graph G).

$$P(x) = \frac{1}{Z} \prod_{i \in V} \psi_i(x_i) \prod_{\{i,j\} \in G} \psi_{ij}(x_i, x_j)$$

Markov property:



$$P(x_A, x_B | x_S) = P(x_A | x_S) P(x_B | x_S)$$

Given the potential functions  $\psi$ , the goal of *inference* is to compute marginals  $P(x_i) = \sum_{x_{V\setminus i}} P(x)$  or the normalization constant Z, which is generally difficult in large, complex graphical models.

## Gaussian Graphical Model

Information form of Gaussian density.

$$P(x) \propto \exp\left\{-\frac{1}{2}x^T J x + h^T x\right\}$$

Inference corresponds to calculation of mean vector  $\mu = J^{-1}h$ , covariance matrix  $K = J^{-1}$  or determinant  $Z = \det J^{-1}$ .

Gaussian graphical model: sparse J matrix

$$J_{ij} \neq 0$$
 if and only if  $\{i, j\} \in G$ 

Potentials:

$$\psi_i(x_i) = e^{-\frac{1}{2}J_{ii}x_i^2 + h_i x_i}$$
  
$$\psi_{ij}(x_i, x_j) = e^{-J_{ij}x_i x_j}$$

Marginals  $P(x_i)$  specified by means  $\mu_i$  and variances  $K_{ii}$ .

## **Belief Propagation**

Belief Propagation iteratively updates a set of messages  $\mu_{i \to j}(x_j)$  defined on directed edges of the graph G using the rule:

$$\mu_{i\to j}(x_j) \propto \sum_{x_i} \psi_i(x_i) \prod_{k \in \mathcal{N}(i) \setminus j} \mu_{k\to i}(x_i) \psi(x_i, x_j)$$

Iterate message updates until converges to a fixed point.

Marginal Estimates: combine messages at a node

$$P(x_i) = \frac{1}{Z_i} \underbrace{\psi_i(x_i) \prod_{k \in N(i)} \mu_{k \to i}(x_i)}_{\tilde{\psi}_i(x_i)}$$

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

# Belief Propagation II

Pairwise Estimates (on edges of graph):

$$P(x_i, x_j) = \frac{1}{Z_{ij}} \tilde{\psi}_i(x_i) \tilde{\psi}_j(x_j) \underbrace{\frac{\psi(x_i, x_j)}{\mu_{i \to j}(x_j) \mu_{j \to i}(x_i)}}_{\tilde{\psi}_{ij}(x_i, x_j)}$$

Estimate of Normalization Constant:

$$Z^{\mathrm{bp}} = \prod_{i \in V} Z_i \prod_{\{i,j\} \in G} \frac{Z_{ij}}{Z_i Z_j}$$

BP fixed point is *saddle point* of RHS with respect to messages/reparameterizations.

In trees, BP converges in finite number of steps and is exact (equivalent to variable elimination).

Gaussian Belief Propagation (GaBP)

Messages 
$$\mu_{i \to j}(x_j) \propto \exp\{\frac{1}{2}\alpha_{i \to j}x_j^2 + \beta_{i \to j}x_j\}.$$

BP fixed-point equations reduce to:

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_{i \to j} &= J_{ij}^2 (J_{ii} - \alpha_{i \setminus j})^{-1} \\ \beta_{i \to j} &= -J_{ij} (J_{ii} - \alpha_{i \setminus j})^{-1} (h_i + \beta_{i \setminus j}) \end{aligned}$$

where  $\alpha_{i \setminus j} = \sum_{k \in N(i) \setminus j} \alpha_{k \to i}$  and  $\beta_{i \setminus j} = \sum_{k \in N(i) \setminus j} \alpha_{k \to i}$ . Marginals specified by:

$$\mathcal{K}_{i}^{\mathrm{bp}} = (J_{ii} - \sum_{k \in \mathcal{N}(i)} \alpha_{k \to i})^{-1}$$
$$\mu_{i}^{\mathrm{bp}} = \mathcal{K}_{i}^{\mathrm{bp}}(h_{i} + \sum_{k \in \mathcal{N}(i)} \beta_{k \to i})$$

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

### Gaussian BP Determinant Estimate

Estimates of pairwise covariance on edges:

$$\mathcal{K}_{(ij)}^{\mathrm{bp}} = \left(\begin{array}{cc} J_{ii} - \alpha_{i \setminus j} & J_{ij} \\ J_{ij} & J_{jj} - \alpha_{j \setminus i} \end{array}\right)^{-1}$$

Estimate of  $Z \triangleq \det K = \det J^{-1}$ :

$$Z^{\mathrm{bp}} = \prod_{i \in V} Z_i \prod_{\{i,j\} \in G} \frac{Z_{ij}}{Z_i Z_j}$$

where  $Z_i = K_i^{\text{bp}}$  and  $Z_{ij} = \det K_{(ij)}^{\text{bp}}$ .

Exact in tree models (equivalent to Gaussian elimination), approximate in loopy models.

# The BP Computation Tree

BP marginal estimates are equivalent to the exact marginal in a tree-structured model [Weiss & Freeman].



The BP messages correspond to upwards variable elimination steps in this computation tree.

・ロト ・ 一 ト ・ モト ・ モト

ъ

Neumann Series and Walk-Sums<sup>†</sup>

Let 
$$J = I - R$$
. If  $ho(R) < 1$  then  $(I - R)^{-1} = \sum_{L=0}^{\infty} R^L$ .

Walk-Sum interpretation of inference:

$$K_{ij} = \sum_{L=0}^{\infty} \sum_{w: i \stackrel{L}{\to} j} R^w \stackrel{?}{=} \sum_{w: i \rightarrow j} R^w$$

$$\mu_i = \sum_j h_j \sum_{L=0}^{\infty} \sum_{w: j \stackrel{L}{\to} i} R^w \stackrel{?}{=} \sum_{w: * \to i} h_* R^w$$

Walk-Summable if  $\sum_{w:i\to j} |R^w|$  converges for all i, j. Absolute convergence implies convergence of walk-sums (to same value) for arbitrary orderings and partitions of the set of walks. Equivalent to  $\rho(|R|) < 1$ .

\*Prior work with D. Malioutov and A. Willsky (NIPS, JMLR).

# Zeta Function and Orbit-Product

What about the determinant?

Definition of Orbits:

- A walk is *closed* if it begins and ends at same vertex.
- It is primitive if does not repeat a shorter walk.
- Two primitive walks are *equivalent* if one is a cyclic shift of the other.
- ▶ Define orbits l ∈ L of G to be equivalence classes of closed, primitive walks.

**Theorem.** Let  $Z \triangleq \det(I - R)^{-1}$ . If  $\rho(|R|) < 1$  then

$$Z = \prod_\ell (1-{\mathcal R}^\ell)^{-1} riangleq \prod_\ell Z_\ell.$$

Closely resembles definition of zeta functions in graph theory.

# Walk-Sum Interpretation of GaBP<sup>†</sup>

Combine interpretation of BP as exact inference on computation tree with walk-sum interpretation of Gaussian inference in trees:

- complete walk-sum for the means
- incomplete walk-sum for the variances
- messages represent walk-sums in subtrees of computation tree

<sup>†</sup>Prior work with D. Malioutov and A. Willsky (NIPS, JMLR).

# $Z_{bp}$ as Totally-Backtracking Orbit-Product

Classification of Orbits:

- Orbit is reducible if it contains backtracking steps ...(ij)(ji)..., else it is irreducible (or backtrackless).
- Every orbit ℓ has a unique irreducible core γ = Γ(ℓ) obtained by iteratively deleting pairs of backtracking steps until no more remain. Let L<sub>γ</sub> denote the set of all orbits that reduce to γ.
- Orbit is totally backtracking (or trivial) if it reduces to the empty orbit Γ(ℓ) = Ø, else it is non-trivial.

**Theorem.** If  $\rho(|R|) < 1$  then  $Z^{\text{bp}}$  (defined earlier) is equal to the totally-backtracking orbit-product:

$$Z^{\mathrm{bp}} = \prod_{\ell \in \mathcal{L}_{\emptyset}} Z_{\ell}$$

### Orbit-Product Correction and Error Bound

Orbit-product correction to  $Z^{bp}$ :

$$Z = Z^{\mathrm{bp}} \prod_{\ell 
ot \in \mathcal{L}_{\emptyset}} Z_{\ell}$$

*Error Bound:* missing orbits must all involve cycles of the graph...

$$\left|\log rac{Z}{Z^{\mathrm{bp}}}
ight| \leq rac{
ho^{\mathrm{g}}}{g(1-
ho)}$$

where  $\rho \triangleq \rho(|R|) < 1$  and g is girth of the graph (length of shortest cycle).

## Reduction to Backtrackless Orbit-Product Correction

We may reduce the orbit-product correction to one over just backtrackless orbits  $\gamma$ 

$$Z = Z_{\mathrm{bp}} \prod_{\ell} Z_{\ell} = Z_{\mathrm{bp}} \prod_{\gamma} \underbrace{\left(\prod_{\ell \in \mathcal{L}(\gamma)} Z_{\ell}\right)}_{Z'_{\gamma}}$$

with modified orbit-factors  $Z_{\gamma}^{\prime}$  based on GaBP

$$Z'_{\gamma} = (1 - \prod_{(ij) \in \gamma} r'_{ij})^{-1}$$
 where  $r'_{ij} \triangleq (1 - lpha_{i \setminus j})^{-1} r_{ij}$ 

The factor  $(1 - \alpha_{i\setminus j})^{-1}$  serves to reconstruct totally-backtracking walks at each point *i* along the backtrackless orbit  $\gamma$ .

### Backtrackless Determinant Correction

Define backtrackless graph G' of G as follows: nodes of G' correspond to directed edges of G, edges  $(ij) \rightarrow (jk)$  for  $k \neq i$ .



Let R' be adjacency matrix of G' with modified edge-weights r' based on GaBP. Then,

$$Z = Z_{\rm bp} \det(I - R')^{-1}$$

## Block-Resummation Method

Let  $\mathcal{B}$  be a collection of subsets of nodes (*blocks*)  $B \subset V$  such that if  $A, B \in \mathcal{B}$  the  $A \cap B \in \mathcal{B}$ . Define  $n_B = 1 - \sum_{B' \supseteq B} n_{B'}$ .

To capture all orbits covered by any block (without over-counting) we calculate the estimate:

$$Z_{\mathcal{B}} \triangleq \prod_{B} Z_{B}^{n_{B}} \triangleq \prod_{B} (\det(I - R_{B})^{-1})^{n_{B}}$$

*Error Bounds.* Select blocks to cover all orbits up to length *L*. Then,

$$\left|\frac{1}{n}\log\frac{Z_{\mathcal{B}}}{Z}\right| \leq \frac{\rho^L}{L(1-\rho)}$$

Similar approach to estimate  $Z' \triangleq \det(I - R')^{-1}$  from sub-matrices of R'. Error controlled by  $\rho' \leq \rho$ .

### Example: 2-D Grids

256 × 256 Periodic Grid, uniform edge weights  $r \in [0, .25]$ . Blocks:  $L \times L$ ,  $L \times \frac{L}{2}$ ,  $\frac{L}{2} \times L$  and  $\frac{L}{2} \times \frac{L}{2}$  shifted by  $\frac{L}{2}$ . Test with L = 2, 4, 8, 16, 32.



# Conclusion and Future Work

Graphical view of inference in walk-summable Gaussian graphical models give a very intuitive framework for understanding iterative inference algorithms and approximation methods.

Future Work:

- Extension to Generalized Belief Propagation (iterative message-passing between blocks).
- Extension to Non-Walksummable Models: compute corrections to inference based on nearest walk-summable model.
- Boot-Strapping GaBP using powers of a matrix.
- Multiscale resummation methods to approximate long orbits from coarse-grained model.