Nonparametric Estimation of the Precision-Recall Curve

Nicolas Vayatis (ENS Cachan, France)

ICML - June 2009

Joint work with Stéphan Clémençon (Telecom ParisTech)

<□▶ <舂▶ <き≯ <き▶ = き

900

- Problem: Bipartite ranking
- Assume: we have designed a scoring rule for ranking new data
- **Issue:** Performance assessment
- Choice of a performance measure: Precision and Recall

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで

Variability of a ranking performance measure



▲ロト ▲圖ト ▲国ト ▲国ト 三国 - のへで

Confidence bands for Precision-Recall curves?



▲ロト ▲圖ト ▲国ト ▲国ト 三国 - のへで

- Some work on estimation of the ROC curve:
 - [Hsieh and Turnbull, AOS 1996]
 - [Macskassy and Provost, ECAI 2004], and [M., P., and Rosset, ICML 2005]
 - ▶ [Bertail, Clémençon, and Vayatis, NIPS 2008]

<ロト <(四)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)> <(0)>

▶ [Horvath, Horvath, and Zhou, JSPI 2008]

- Some work on estimation of the ROC curve:
 - [Hsieh and Turnbull, AOS 1996]
 - [Macskassy and Provost, ECAI 2004], and [M., P., and Rosset, ICML 2005]
 - [Bertail, Clémençon, and Vayatis, NIPS 2008]

590

- ▶ [Horvath, Horvath, and Zhou, JSPI 2008]
- None on PR curves!

- Visual display of performance at various levels
- Justification: the optimal curve is above all the others



- Visual display of performance at various levels
- Justification: the optimal curve is above all the others

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで

• ROC vs. Precision-Recall?

- Visual display of performance at various levels
- Justification: the optimal curve is above all the others
- ROC vs. Precision-Recall?
- ROC curves are independent of $p = \mathbb{P}\{Y = +1\}$
- PR curves best for highly skewed distributions (p small)
 (see Davis & Goadrich, ICML 2006)

▲ロト ▲圖ト ▲国ト ▲国ト 三国 - のへで

Probabilistic model

- (Z, Y) random pair with unknown distribution P
- $Z \in \mathbb{R}$ pointwise score evaluation
- $Y \in \{-1, +1\}$ binary label/class
- Conditional distributions:

$$F_+(z) = \mathbb{P}\{Z \leq z \mid Y = +1\}$$
 and $F_-(z) = \mathbb{P}\{Z \leq z \mid Y = -1\}$

- Proportion: $p = \mathbb{P}\{Y = +1\}$
- Marginal distribution of Z:

$$F = pF_+ + (1-p)F_-$$

▲ロト ▲圖ト ▲国ト ▲国ト 三国 - のへで

- Precision: $\mathbb{P}\{Z \ge t \mid Y = +1\}$
- Recall: $\mathbb{P}{Y = +1 \mid Z \ge t}$
- Definition of the PR curve:

$$\operatorname{PR} : t \in \mathbb{R} \mapsto \left(\mathbb{P}\{Z \ge t \mid Y = +1\}, \ \mathbb{P}\{Y = +1 \mid Z \ge t\} \right) ,$$

or

$$ext{PR} \; : \; t \in \mathbb{R} \mapsto \left(1 - F_+(t), \; p\left(rac{1 - F_+(t)}{1 - F(t)}
ight)
ight)$$

٠

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへで

• Identical populations. If $F_+ = F_-$ then $PR(t) = (1 - F_+(t), p)$

Limits.

$$\lim_{t \to -\infty} \operatorname{PR}(t) = (1, p)$$

$$\lim_{t \to +\infty} \operatorname{PR}(t) = \left(0, \frac{p\ell}{p\ell + 1 - p}\right), \quad \text{where } \ell = \lim_{t \to +\infty} \frac{dF_+}{dF_-}(t)$$

Monotonicity.

PR curve is decreasing if likelihood ratio dF_+/dF_- is monotone.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで

Reparameterization of the PR curve

• Conditional quantile function:

$$x \in [0,1] \mapsto (F_+)^{-1}(1-x)$$

• False positive rate at level x:

$$\alpha(x) = 1 - F_{-} \circ (F_{+})^{-1} (1 - x)$$

• PR curve as the plot of PR function:

$$PR : x \in [0,1] \mapsto \frac{px}{px + (1-p)\alpha(x)}$$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへの

.

Empirical PR function

- Data: $(Z_1, Y_1), \dots, (Z_n, Y_n)$ i.i.d.
- Number of positives:

$$n_+ = \sum_{i=1}^n \mathbb{I}\{Y_i = +1\}$$

• Empirical false positive rate at x:

$$\widehat{\alpha}(x) = 1 - \widehat{F}_{-} \circ (\widehat{F}_{+})^{-1}(1-x)$$

• Empirical PR function:

$$\widehat{\mathrm{PR}}(x) = \frac{n_+ x}{n_+ x + (n - n_+)\widehat{\alpha}(x)} \; .$$

590

- \bullet Set $\widehat{\mathrm{PR}}$ to be the empirical PR function based on i.i.d. data
- Normalized PR fluctuation process:

$$R_n(x) = \sqrt{n} \left(\widehat{\mathrm{PR}}(x) - \mathrm{PR}(x)\right)$$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで

• Set $\epsilon > 0$ and consider $x \in [\epsilon, 1 - \epsilon]$

Technical assumptions

• Conditional distributions F_+ and F_- are equivalent and continuous

• For all
$$x \in (\epsilon, 1-\epsilon)$$
:
 $F'_+(F^{-1}_+(x)) > 0$

• Tangent of $x \mapsto \alpha(x)$ is bounded, i.e.

$$\sup_{x \in [\epsilon, 1-\epsilon]} \frac{F'_{-} \circ F_{+}^{-1}(x)}{F'_{+} \circ F_{+}^{-1}(x)} < \infty$$

• There exists $\gamma > 0$ such that:

$$\sup_{x\in(\epsilon,1-\epsilon)}rac{d}{dx}\log(extsf{F}_+'\circ extsf{F}_+^{-1}(x))\leq\gamma<\infty\;.$$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへで

Theorem 1

Under the previous assumptions, we have, almost surely, as $n \to \infty$:

(i)
$$\sup_{x\in[\epsilon,1-\epsilon]}|\widehat{\operatorname{PR}}(x)-\operatorname{PR}(x)| o 0$$
 ,

(ii) uniformly over
$$[\epsilon, 1 - \epsilon]$$
: $R_n(x) = Z^{(n)}(x) + o\left(\frac{L(n, \gamma)}{\sqrt{n}}\right)$

where

- ► {Z⁽ⁿ⁾} is a sequence of random processes with gaussian marginals and involves F₊, F₋ and their derivatives
- $L(n,\gamma) = (\log \log n)^{\rho_1(\gamma)} (\log n)^{\rho_2(\gamma)}$

and
$$\begin{cases} \rho_1(\gamma) = 0, \quad \rho_2(\gamma) = 1, & \text{if } \gamma < 1\\ \rho_1(\gamma) = 0, \quad \rho_2(\gamma) = 2, & \text{if } \gamma = 1\\ \rho_1(\gamma) = \gamma, \quad \rho_2(\gamma) = \gamma - 1 + \varepsilon, \ \varepsilon > 0, & \text{if } \gamma > 1. \end{cases}$$

Expression of the strong approximation

- Set $\{B_1^{(n)}\}$ and $\{B_2^{(n)}\}$ two independent sequences of brownian bridges on [0,1]
- Set W a gaussian r.v. independent from $\{B_1^{(n)}\}, \{B_2^{(n)}\}$
- Formula for $Z^{(n)}$:

$$Z^{(n)}(x) = \frac{\operatorname{PR}(x)^2}{x} \left(\alpha(x) \left(\sqrt{\frac{1-p}{p^3}} \right) W + \frac{1-p}{p^{3/2}} \left(\frac{F'_- \circ F_+^{-1}(x)}{F'_+ \circ F_+^{-1}(x)} \right) B_1^{(n)}(x) + \left(\frac{\sqrt{1-p}}{p} \right) B_2^{(n)}(\alpha(x)) \right)$$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで

for some W, $\{B_1^{(n)}\}$ and $\{B_2^{(n)}\}$.

- Want: Confidence bands on the true PR
- **Got:** explicit gaussian limit distribution for $R_{n...}$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへで

- Want: Confidence bands on the true PR
- Got: explicit gaussian limit distribution for R_n...
- ... but they depend on the unknown distribution!

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへで

- Want: Confidence bands on the true PR
- Got: explicit gaussian limit distribution for R_n...
- ... but they depend on the unknown distribution!

• Idea: Use bootstrap

- Want: Confidence bands on the true PR
- Got: explicit gaussian limit distribution for $R_{n...}$
- ... but they depend on the unknown distribution!
- Idea: Use bootstrap
- **Drawback:** Naive bootstrap for quantile estimation has a very slow rate of convergence

▲ロト ▲圖ト ▲国ト ▲国ト 三国 - のへで

- $\bullet~{\rm Set}~{\rm PR}^* = {\rm empirical}~{\sf PR}$ curve obtained on a bootstrap sample
- Bootstrapped PR fluctuation process:

$$R_n^* = \left\{ \sqrt{n} (\operatorname{PR}^*(x) - \widehat{\operatorname{PR}}(x)) \right\}_{x \in [\epsilon, 1-\epsilon]}$$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへで

 \bullet Resampling from smoothed distributions: $\widehat{F}_{+/-} \to \widetilde{F}_{+/-}$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへで

 \rightarrow use kernel smoothing

 \rightarrow e.g. gaussian kernel with bandwidth $h = h_n$

• Resampling from smoothed distributions: $\widehat{F}_{+/-} \to \widetilde{F}_{+/-}$

 \rightarrow use kernel smoothing

 \rightarrow e.g. gaussian kernel with bandwidth $h = h_n$

- Practical procedure:
 - Draw with replacement $(Z'_1, Y^*_1), \ldots, (Z'_n, Y^*_n)$ from $(Z_1, Y_1), \ldots, (Z_n, Y_n)$
 - Add an independent gaussian perturbation $\epsilon_j \sim \mathcal{N}(0, h^2)$ to each Z'_i :

$$Z_j^* = Z_j' + \epsilon_j$$

・ロト ・日ト ・ヨト ・ヨー うへで

• Get bootstrap *n*-sample: $(Z_1^*, Y_1^*), \dots, (Z_n^*, Y_n^*)$

Importance bootstrap confidence bands

- ullet Importance sampling: use mixture parameter $\widetilde{\it p}\simeq 1/2$
 - \rightarrow use the importance function correction in the estimation
- Importance function:

$$\gamma_n = \left(\frac{n_+^*}{n\widetilde{\rho}}\right)^{n_+^*} \left(\frac{n-n_+^*}{n(1-\widetilde{\rho})}\right)^{n-n_+^*}$$

- Notations: $\mathbb{E}^*[.]$ expected value over bootstrap *n*-sample distribution
- Find $r(\delta)$ such that:

$$\mathbb{E}^*\left[\gamma_n\cdot\mathbb{I}\left\{\sup_{x\in[\epsilon,1-\epsilon]}|R_n^*(x)|\leq r(\delta)\right\}\right]=1-\delta$$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆注▶ ◆注▶ 注 のへで

Bootstrap validity

Set:

•
$$H_{n,\epsilon}(r) = \mathbb{P}\left\{\sup_{x \in [\epsilon, 1-\epsilon]} |R_n(x)| \le r\right\}$$

• $H_{n,\epsilon}^{boot}(r) = \mathbb{E}^*\left[\gamma_n \cdot \mathbb{I}\left\{\sup_{x \in [\epsilon, 1-\epsilon]} |R_n^*(x)| \le r\right\}\right]$

Theorem 2

Same assumptions as before. Take also: $h_n \simeq (n \log^3 n)^{-1/5}$. Then, we have as $n \to \infty$:

$$\sup_{r \in \mathbb{R}_+} |H_{n,\epsilon}(r) - H_{n,\epsilon}^{boot}(r)| = o_{\mathbb{P}}\left(n^{-2/5}\right)$$

.

590

• Promote statistical approach to machine learning concepts

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで

- Statistical theory may be helpful
- PR curve learning still at an early stage!

- Promote statistical approach to machine learning concepts
- Statistical theory may be helpful
- PR curve learning still at an early stage!
- Statistical theory for ROC curve learning check our papers!

◆□▶ ◆舂▶ ◆注▶ ◆注▶ 三注.

- ► COLT'05, ALT'08, NIPS'08 (x 3), AISTAT'09
- JMLR 2007, AOS 2008, IEEE IT (to app.)
- ... and more to come!
- R package for ROC curve learning soon available!