# Linking people in videos with "their" names using coreference resolution 

Vignesh Ramanathan, Armand Joulin, Percy Liang, Li Fei-Fei

Computer Science Department Stanford Vision Lab


## Video Data



## Video Data

## + Text Data



## Video Data



## Video Data

## + Text Data



## Video Data

## + Text Data



## Video Data <br> + Text Data



Everingham et al. 2006
Sivic et al. 2009
Cour et al. 2009
Tapaswi et al. 2012

TV Script

Names
Actions
Babaguchi et al. 2002 Xu et al. 2008

Interactions
Events


## Text to Video



## Unidirectional Models: Text to Video



Everingham et al. 2006
Sivic et al. 2009
Cour et al. 2009
Tapaswi et al. 2012
Bojanowski et al. '13

## Unidirectional Models: Text to Video



Everingham et al. 2006
Sivic et al. 2009
Cour et al. 2009
Tapaswi et al. 2012
Bojanowski et al. '13

Use Limited Information
Only proper nouns

## Unidirectional Models: Text to Video



Everingham et al. 2006
Sivic et al. 2009
Cour et al. 2009
Tapaswi et al. 2012
Bojanowski et al. '13

Use Limited Information
Only proper nouns
Treat Videos and Script as bag of tracks and names

## Unidirectional Models: Text to Video

Unidirectional Models
Only proper nouns

Treat Videos and Script as
bag of tracks and names

## Temporal ordering of people



## Temporal ordering of people



People appear in the same order in both text and videos

## Temporal ordering of people



## Coreference Resolution in NLP



To use the alignment we need to identify the name of pronouns

## Coreference Resolution in NLP



To use the alignment we need to identify the name of pronouns

## Coreference Resolution in NLP



Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary She turns

## Coreference Resolution in NLP



## Coreference Resolution in NLP



## Coreference Resolution in NLP



Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary. She turns

A challenging NLP task
Coreference Resolution

## Coreference Resolution in NLP



Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary. She turns


A challenging NLP task
Coreference Resolution

## Coreference Resolution in NLP



## Coreference Resolution in NLP



## Coreference Resolution in NLP



## Bidirectional model



## Linking people with coreference resolution

Everingham et al. 2006
Sivic et al. 2009
Cour et al. 2009
Tapaswi et al. 2012
Bojanowski et al. '13
Our Bidirectional Model


Unidirectional Models
Only proper nouns
Treat Videos and Script as bag of tracks and names

## Linking people with "their" names

## -Problem setup

## - Our Bidirectional model

- Experiments
- Summary


## Problem Setup (Input)

- Videos with detected human tracks



## Problem Setup (Input)

- Videos with detected human tracks
- Descriptive script partially aligned with video segments

time


## Problem Setup (Input)

- Videos with detected human tracks
- Descriptive script partially aligned with video segments
- Human mentions (nouns, pronouns) identified in the script.

time


## Problem Setup (Input)

- Videos with detected human tracks
- Descriptive script partially aligned with video segments
- Human mentions (nouns, pronouns) identified in the script.
- A list of cast names

Cast List: Roland, Ian, Mary, ...

time

## Problem Setup (Output)


$m_{1} \quad m_{2} \quad m_{3} \quad m_{4}$
Roland arrives as lan waits. He stands with Mary ...

## Problem Setup (Output)

Name assignment to human tracks

$m_{1}$
Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary ...
$m_{5}$
The rider moves closer.

## Problem Setup (Output)

Name assignment to human tracks

$\mathrm{m}_{1}$
$\mathrm{m}_{2}$
$\mathrm{m}_{4}$
Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary ...

$\mathrm{m}_{4}$
The rider moves closer.

## Problem Setup (Output)

Name assignment to human tracks

## Name assignment to human mentions



Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary ...


## Linking people with "their" names

## - Problem setup <br> - Our Bidirectional model

## - Experiments

- Summary


## Our Bidirectional Model

Minimize joint cost of name assignment to tracks and mentions with alignment


## Our Bidirectional Model

Minimize joint cost of name assignment to tracks and mentions with alignment


Tracks
Track name assignment

Names

## Our Bidirectional Model

Minimize joint cost of name assignment to tracks and mentions with alignment


Tracks
Track name assignment


## Our Bidirectional Model

Minimize joint cost of name assignment to tracks and mentions with alignment


## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment



## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment

$$
\mathbf{Y} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times P} \text { Name assignment for tracks }
$$



## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment

$\mathbf{Y} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times P}$ Name assignment for tracks


## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment

$\mathbf{Y} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times P}$ Name assignment for tracks


## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment

$\mathbf{Y} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times P}$ Name assignment for tracks


## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment

## $\mathbf{Y} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times P}$ Name assignment for tracks



## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment

$\mathbf{Y} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times P}$ Name assignment for tracks
Clustering cost*

$$
\operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right)
$$

- Discriminative clustering.
- Tracks with similar features should have same name.


## Convex quadratic in $\mathbf{Y}$

*Bojanowski et al. ICCV'13


## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment

## $\mathbf{Y} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times P}$ Name assignment for tracks

$$
\operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{t r a c k} \mathbf{Y}\right)
$$

## Convex quadratic in $\mathbf{Y}$

*Bojanowski et al. ICCV'13


## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment

## $\mathbf{Y} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times P}$ Name assignment for tracks

$$
\operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right)
$$

Scene constraint


## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment

## $\mathbf{Y} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times P}$ Name assignment for tracks



$$
\operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right)
$$



## Our Bidirectional Model: Track name assignment

$\mathbf{Y} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times P}$ Name assignment for tracks
Clustering cost

$$
\operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right)
$$

Convex quadratic in $\mathbf{Y}$

## Scene constraint <br> 

Linear constraint


## Our Bidirectional Model

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
\text { min } & \operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right) \\
\text { s.t } & \mathbf{Y} \in C_{Y}
\end{array}
$$



## Our Bidirectional Model

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
\text { min } & \operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right) \\
\text { s.t } & \mathbf{Y} \in C_{Y}
\end{array}
$$



Roland arrives as lan waits. He stands with Mary
Mention name
assignment $\uparrow$
Mentions

## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions



## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions



Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary ...


## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions

Mentions independently are not informative!


## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions

We rely on context to identify the mention-name.

Name of an ambiguous mention depends on an antecedent mention


Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary

## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions

$\mathbf{R} \in\{0,1\}^{M^{2}}$ Antecedence variable


Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary


The rider moves closer.

## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions

$\mathbf{R} \in\{0,1\}^{M^{2}}$ Antecedence variable
Every pair of mentions has a text feature vector, which determines antecedence.


Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary


The rider moves closer.

## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions

$\mathbf{R} \in\{0,1\}^{M^{2}}$ Antecedence variable
Every pair of mentions has a text feature vector, which determines antecedence.


Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary


The rider moves closer.

## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions

$\mathbf{R} \in\{0,1\}^{M^{2}}$ Antecedence variable
Every pair of mentions has a text feature vector, which determines antecedence.


Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary

## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions

$\mathbf{R} \in\{0,1\}^{M^{2}}$ Antecedence variable
Every pair of mentions has a text feature vector, which determines antecedence.


Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary
The rider moves closer.

## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions

$\mathbf{R} \in\{0,1\}^{M^{2}}$ Antecedence variable


Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary


The rider moves closer.

## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

$\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions
$\mathbf{R} \in\{0,1\}^{M^{2}}$ Antecedence variable

Antecedent clustering cost

$$
\mathbf{R}^{T} \Pi_{m e n} \mathbf{R}
$$

Convex quadratic in $\mathbf{R}$

- Discriminative clustering
- Mention-pairs with similar features have similar antecedence


Roland arrives as Ian waits. He stands with Mary


The rider moves closer.

## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions

$\mathbf{R} \in\{0,1\}^{M^{2}}$ Antecedence variable

$$
\mathbf{R}^{T} \Pi_{\text {men }} \mathbf{R}
$$

## R



## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

## $\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions

$\mathbf{R} \in\{0,1\}^{M^{2}}$ Antecedence variable

$$
\mathbf{R}^{T} \Pi_{\text {men }} \mathbf{R}
$$

## R constrains Z



Antecedent mention shares the same name.

## Our Bidirectional Model: Mention name assignment

$\mathbf{Z} \in\{0,1\}^{M \times P}$ Name assignment for mentions
$\mathbf{R} \in\{0,1\}^{M^{2}}$ Antecedence variable

Antecedent clustering cost
$\mathbf{R}^{T} \Pi_{\text {men }} \mathbf{R}$
Convex quadratic in $\mathbf{R}$

R constrains Z
$\left\|\mathbf{Z}_{i}-\mathbf{Z}_{j}\right\|_{\infty} \leq\left(1-\mathbf{R}_{i j}\right)$
Convex constraint


Antecedent mention
shares the same name.

## Our Bidirectional Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \min \operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right)+\mathbf{R}^{T} \Pi_{\text {men }} \mathbf{R} \\
& \text { s.t } \quad \mathbf{Y} \in C_{Y}, \quad \mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{R} \in C_{Z, R}
\end{aligned}
$$



Roland


## Our Bidirectional Model

$$
\begin{array}{lll}
\text { min } & \operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right)+ & \mathbf{R}^{T} \Pi_{\text {men }} \mathbf{R} \\
\text { s.t } & \mathbf{Y} \in C_{Y}, & \mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{R} \in C_{z, R}
\end{array}
$$



-     - 。



## Our Bidirectional Model: Alignment

## $\mathbf{A} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times M}$ Alignment matrix between tracks and mentions



## Our Bidirectional Model: Alignment

## $\mathbf{A} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times M}$ Alignment matrix between tracks and mentions



## Our Bidirectional Model: Alignment

## $\mathbf{A} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times M}$ Alignment matrix between tracks and mentions



Aligned tracks share name

## Our Bidirectional Model: Alignment

## $\mathbf{A} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times M}$ Alignment matrix between tracks and mentions



Aligned tracks share name

## Our Bidirectional Model: Alignment

## $\mathbf{A} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times M}$ Alignment matrix between tracks and mentions



## Our Bidirectional Model: Alignment

$\mathbf{A} \in\{0,1\}^{T \times M}$ Alignment matrix between tracks and mentions

Alignment cost
Dynamic Time Warping
Dynamic program to optimize in A (enforces monotonic alignment)

## Our Bidirectional Model

$$
\begin{array}{lll}
\text { min } & \operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right)+\mathbf{R}^{T} \Pi_{\text {men }} \mathbf{R}+\|\mathbf{Y}-\mathbf{A Z}\|_{F}^{2} \\
\text { s.t } & \mathbf{Y} \in C_{Y}, \quad \mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{R} \in C_{Z, R}, & \mathbf{A} \in C_{A}
\end{array}
$$



## Optimization

$$
\begin{array}{lll}
\text { min } & \operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right)+ & \mathbf{R}^{T} \Pi_{\text {men }} \mathbf{R}+\|\mathbf{Y}-\mathbf{A Z}\|_{F}^{2} \\
\text { s.t } & \mathbf{Y} \in C_{Y}, \quad \mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{R} \in C_{Z, R}, \quad \mathbf{A} \in C_{A}
\end{array}
$$

- Relax $\mathbf{Y}, \mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{R}$ to be in [0,1]
- Use Block Coordinate Descent


## Optimization

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \min \\
& \text { s.t }
\end{aligned}\left(\begin{array}{l}
\operatorname{tr}\left(\mathbf{Y}^{T} \Pi_{\text {track }} \mathbf{Y}\right)+ \\
\mathbf{Y} \in C_{Y},
\end{array} \mathbb{R}^{T} \Pi_{\text {men }} \mathbb{R}+\frac{\|\mathbf{Y} \mathbf{- \mathbf { A } Z}\|_{F}^{2}}{\mathbb{R}^{2} \in C_{Z, R}} \frac{\mathbf{A} \in C_{A}}{}\right.
$$

- Relax $\mathbf{Y}, \mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{R}$ to be in [0,1]
- Use Block Coordinate Descent
- Quadratic Program to optimize $\mathbf{Y}$


## Optimization



- Relax $\mathbf{Y}, \mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{R}$ to be in [0,1]
- Use Block Coordinate Descent
- Quadratic Program to optimize $\mathbf{Y}$
- Quadratic Program to optimize Z,R


## Optimization



- Relax Y, Z, R to be in [0,1]
- Use Block Coordinate Descent
- Quadratic Program to optimize $\mathbf{Y}$
- Quadratic Program to optimize Z,R
- Dynamic Program to optimize in terms of A


## Linking people with "their" names

## -Problem setup

- Our Bidirectional model
- Experiments
-Summary


## Dataset



We reveal Lynette holding Porter by his feet, while he clings to Preston's desk.


Missy points to the larger kid. The big kid walks off. Other kids jeer.


Cary eyes the siblings, as Alicia looks across the bullpen

## Dataset



## Dataset



We reveal Lynette holding Porter by his feet, while he clings to Preston's desk.


Missy points to the larger kid. The big kid walks off. Other kids jeer.


Cary eyes the siblings, as Alicia looks across the bullpen
pronoun/nominal

| Dev. Set (14 episodes) | 3329 tracks (3 eps.) | 811 mentions |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |

- No training set since we have no labelled examples.
- The model parameters such as regularization constant are tuned on the dev. set.


## Dataset



## Dataset



We reveal Lynette holding Porter by his feet, while he clings to Preston's desk.


Missy points to the larger kid. The big kid walks off. Other kids jeer.


Cary eyes the siblings, as Alicia looks across the bullpen
pronoun/nominal

| Dev. Set (14 episodes) | $\mathbf{3 3 2 9}$ tracks (3 eps.) | $\mathbf{8 1 1}$ mentions |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Test Set (5 episodes) | $\mathbf{4 7 5 7}$ tracks | $\mathbf{3 0 0}$ mentions |

Tasks:

- Name assignment to tracks;
- Name assignment to mentions;


## Dataset


pronoun/nominal

| $\mathbf{3 3 2 9}$ tracks (3 eps.) | 811 mentions |
| :---: | :---: |
| $\mathbf{4 7 5 7}$ tracks | 300 mentions |

Tasks:

- Name assignment to tracks;
- Name assignment to mentions;


## Experiments: Name Assignment to Tracks



## Experiments: Name Assignment to Tracks



## Experiments: Name Assignment to Tracks



## Experiments: Name Assignment to Tracks



## Dataset



Cary eyes the siblings, as Alicia looks across the bullpen
pronoun/nominal
811 mentions
300 mentions

Tasks:

- Name assignment to tracks;
- Name assignment to mentions;


## Experiments: Name Assignment to Mentions



## Experiments: Name Assignment to Mentions



## Experiments: Name Assignment to Mentions



## Experiments: Benefit of bidirectional model

## Experiments: Benefit of bidirectional model



Gabriel cues the entry of Rowan. Rose doesn't notice him. He takes her in his arms.

## Experiments: Benefit of bidirectional model



## Experiments: Benefit of bidirectional model

Edouard \& MacLeod unfurl the canvas, searching for the name. He then peers at it. She turns

## Experiments: Benefit of bidirectional model



## Error Analysis: Name Assignment to Mentions



## Error Analysis: Name Assignment to Mentions



## Error Analysis: Name Assignment to Mentions



## Linking people with "their" names

## - Problem setup

## - Our Bidirectional model

- Experiments
- Summary


## Summary

Bidirectional model to handle challenging problems in Vision and NLP

Temporal ordering based alignment


Cary eyes the siblings, as Alicia looks across the bullpen

## Thank You



NGT Matlomal Instilute at Shandarda and Tochmolesy

## Google intel

Microsoft ${ }$ Research Mind's Eye OARPA

